



## OTM-R CHECKLIST

**Self-assessment checklist for Open, Transparent and Merit-Based Recruitment (OTM-R), reflecting on the status of achievement Mid 2019 and on the indicators that will be used to measure (future) progress.**

DATE GAP ANALYSIS: Spring 2019

SUBMITTED TO THE EUROPEAN COMMISSION IN DECEMBER 2019

### SCORE GRID

Ghent University used the following score grid to evaluate the implementation of the principles described in the Charter and Code (the same method as was used for the GAP analysis):

++: degree of implementation >90 %

+/-: 70-90 %

-/+ : 50-70 %

--: < 50 %

<i>OTM-R checklist for organisations</i>					
	Open	Trans- parent	Merit- Based	Answer: ++ <i>Yes, completely</i> +/- <i>Yes, substantially</i> -/+ <i>Yes, partially</i> -- <i>No</i>	Suggested indicators (or form of measurement)
<b>OTM-R system</b>					
1. Have we published a version of our OTM-R policy online (in the national language and in English)?	x	x	x	-- <i>No</i>	Ghent University was awarded the HR Excellence in Research Award in 2014, before the OTM-R policy became mandatory. Ghent University does not yet have a formal overarching OTM-R policy. However, several actions based on OTM-R principles have been implemented in the daily practice, and OTM-R is the guiding framework of reference in new HR projects.  <b>Indicator:</b> OTM-R policy published on the external website.
2. Do we have an internal guide setting out clear OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions?	x	x	x	-/+ <i>Yes, partially</i>	Several OTM-R principles have been introduced in formal rules and staff regulations. The most explicit examples are 1) the staff regulations for professorial staff funded by the Special Research Fund (BOF-ZAP): e.g., sufficiently broad profile of the vacancy with wide international advertisement; the selection committee for a BOF-ZAP vacancy must be composed of member(s) external to the own faculty; 2) the staff regulations for research staff on the Ghent University payroll: OTM-R principles as a basis for open vacancies.  Several OTM-R principles have been presented to the target group as guidelines and good practices: An informative leaflet on how to recruit research staff based on OTM-R principles has been available to supervisors since 2016. This leaflet is externally available (in Dutch/English): <a href="https://www.ugent.be/en/research/career/top-talent.htm">https://www.ugent.be/en/research/career/top-talent.htm</a> > tips. General principles for the evaluation of research(ers) are published on the website: <a href="https://www.ugent.be/en/research/research-evaluation.htm">https://www.ugent.be/en/research/research-evaluation.htm</a> .  <b>Indicator:</b> OTM-R procedures and practices for all types of positions internally available (e.g., published on the internal website).
3. Is everyone involved in the process sufficiently trained in the area of OTM-R?	x	x	x	-/+ <i>Yes, partially</i>	A training programme <b>for professors</b> is available with the aim of supporting supervisors in a better qualitative and merit-based screening of their research staff, focusing on good recruitment and hiring procedures ('Selection techniques 1: CV and cover letter', 'Selection techniques 2:

					<p>competency-based interview and STARR-methodology'). Ghent University has recently launched two additional initiatives:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- A peer-learning network for professorial staff specifically on the topic of selection practices and the onboarding of international research staff</li> <li>- An online screening of PhD candidates (portfolio of assessment tools) in collaboration with an external HR partner.</li> </ul> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Training programme: topics &amp; number of training sessions</li> <li>- Number of staff following training in OTM-R</li> <li>- Other forms of support</li> </ul>
4. Do we make (sufficient) use of e-recruitment tools?	x	x		<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Ghent University has implemented an e-recruitment tool that covers all steps of the hiring process. This is being used for the recruitment of assistant academic staff (AAP, since 2016) and professorial staff (ZAP, since 2017). <a href="https://www.ugent.be/en/work">https://www.ugent.be/en/work</a></p> <p>We are currently working on incorporating the recruitment process for other research staff in the same tool.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Number of vacancies for each staff category</li> <li>- Integration of vacancies of other staff/research positions than assistant academic / professorial staff</li> </ul>
5. Do we have a quality control system for OTM-R in place?	x	x	x	<i>-/+ Yes, partially</i>	<p>Recruitment of academic staff is mainly a decentralised process. As there is no university-wide OTM-R policy, not all elements of OTM-R are systematically being monitored for all academic staff, and an overarching quality control system is not available.</p> <p>However, the faculty boards and the university board monitor relevant aspects of OTM-R, such as the content of the vacancies. For specific vacancies (i.e., professorial staff funded by the Special Research Fund, BOF-ZAP), the Research Council does an extra quality control check through the lens of OTM-R (e.g., advertising sufficiently broad and internationally recognizable profiles, checking merit-based criteria in the selection of the final candidate and including external referees in the selection process).</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> Comprehensive and integrated quality control system for OTM-R available.</p>

6. Does our current OTM-R policy encourage external candidates to apply?	x	x	x	<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Vacancies approved by the university board are published in Dutch and in English on the university's website, Euraxess and Academic Positions (mandatory) and ResearchGate (only for full-time professorial staff vacancies) as well as on other relevant platforms such as field-specific academic job portals and networks and websites of professional organisations to reach potential candidates from outside of academia (optional).</p> <p>Brief information about working at Ghent University can be found on the university website and/or in the vacancy.  <a href="https://www.uqent.be/en/work">https://www.uqent.be/en/work</a></p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> Trend in the share of applicants from outside Ghent University (= ratio applicants with an MA degree or a PhD obtained at Ghent University/an MA or a PhD obtained elsewhere).</p>
7. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract researchers from abroad?	x	x	x	<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Idem question 6</p> <p>With its new policy plan on internationalisation, Ghent University will make the recruitment and onboarding of international academic staff (before and after selection and arrival) a priority for the near future, for example, by means of a new employer branding programme.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> Trend in the share of applicants from abroad (= ratio applicants with a Belgian nationality/non-Belgian nationality; ratio applicants with a PhD obtained at a Belgian university/PhD obtained outside of Belgium).</p>
8. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to attract underrepresented groups?	x	x	x	<i>-/+ Yes, partially</i>	<p>A diversity and gender statement is included in all vacancies approved by the university board ("Ghent University conducts an equal opportunities policy and encourages everyone to apply. Ghent University aims for a gender balance"). Selection committees are gender balanced. In case of equal qualifications, priority is given to members of underrepresented groups in selections by the Special Research Fund.</p> <p>Potential applicants can find information about working conditions and work-family balance (e.g., child care facilities) on the Ghent University website: <a href="https://www.uqent.be/en/work/employee-benefits">https://www.uqent.be/en/work/employee-benefits</a></p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Trend in the share of applicants from underrepresented groups (e.g., women, international candidates – see also indicator question 7)</li> <li>- Gender &amp; diversity bias training modules for members of selection committees (existing and new)</li> </ul>

9. Is our current OTM-R policy in line with policies to provide attractive working conditions for researchers?	x	x	x	<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Several actions have been taken to offer attractive working conditions to researchers, such as a wide range of training and career development opportunities for researchers at all stages, initiatives to improve work-life balance (e.g., childcare facilities), working remotely, excellent insurance coverage (Belgian social security), travel reimbursement, the faculty mobility fund, sports, catering and health facilities.</p> <p>Recently, Ghent University has taken several strategic decisions to improve the support and academic comfort of specific categories:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Professorial staff: a new career and evaluation policy has been implemented, based on a talent-oriented and qualitative approach of the professorial job; the Special Research Fund introduced a research starting grant for every newly appointed professor.</li> <li>- Research staff on the Ghent University payroll: a new career model with fair working conditions (e.g., indefinite-term contract and a pension plan) and transparent career prospects.</li> </ul> <p><b>Indicator:</b> Clear staff regulations covering fair working conditions for all academic staff.</p>
10. Do we have means to monitor whether the most suitable researchers apply?				<i>-- No</i>	<p>See question 5</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> The low number of dismissals and/or the low number of professors not being appointed after their tenure-track period might be seen as an (imperfect) indicator of the fact that the university attracts the most suitable researchers.</p>
<b>Advertising and application phase</b>					
11. Do we have clear guidelines or templates (e.g., EURAXESS) for advertising positions?	x	x		<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>HR provides standard templates for vacancies for assistant academic and professorial staff. These templates will be fine-tuned when further implementing the OTM-R principles in our standard practices. For other research staff, there are no standard vacancy templates yet.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> Templates (updated and new) available for each job profile of the academic staff.</p>
12. Do we include in the job advertisement references/links to all the elements foreseen in the relevant section of the toolkit?	x	x		<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Job advertisements (in particular for vacancies approved by the university board) include the following information: organisation and recruiting department, job title, job description, required and desirable competencies, professional experience, admission requirements, application process, selection procedure, evaluation criteria, appointment information, type of contract, professional development opportunities, career development</p>

					prospects, working conditions, entitlements (including a specific offer for incoming international staff), a gender and diversity statement and contact information. Other types of vacancies can be less comprehensive.  <b>Indicator:</b> Templates (updated and new) available for each job profile of the academic staff.
13. Do we make full use of EURAXESS to ensure our research vacancies reach a wider audience?	x	x		<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	The Euraxess jobsite is one of the standard publication channels for research vacancies. All vacancies for professorial staff, assistant academic staff and other research staff are published in English on Euraxess.  <b>Indicator:</b> - Trend in the share of job adverts posted on EURAXESS - Trend in the share of applicants recruited from outside the organisation/abroad (see indicator question 7)
14. Do we make use of other job advertising tools?	x	x		<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	In addition to on the university's corporate website and Euraxess, all vacancies for each job profile are posted on Academic Positions. (Full-time) professorial staff vacancies are also posted on ResearchGate. Departments advertise vacancies via faculty- or field-specific channels and other relevant platforms (depending on the discipline, type of vacancy etc.), including via social media.  <b>Indicator:</b> See indicators question 6.
15. Do we keep the administrative burden to a minimum for the candidate?	x			<i>-/+ Yes, partially</i>	Although applicants can upload all required documents in the automated e-recruitment tool, the standard application forms (especially for professorial staff) require the input of a large amount of data and information. When further implementing the OTM-R principles, the standard application form will be revisited to keep the administrative burden to a minimum. Several measures are already in place with the aim to lower the administrative burden: for example, certificates of equivalence (if required) can be submitted during or after the application process. Postdoctoral applicants for the Special Research Fund do not need to submit a new application as this is handled on the basis of their preceding application for the Research Foundation Flanders (FWO).  <b>Indicator:</b> - An adapted application form for professorial staff - An automated application process for PhD calls by the Special Research Fund so applicants need to supply less data

Selection and evaluation phase					
16. Do we have clear rules governing the appointment of selection committees?		x	x	<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<p>The rules on the appointment and composition of selection committees are stipulated in the staff regulations.</p> <p>For the recruitment of some categories of research staff on the Ghent University payroll, certain exceptions are allowed (aligning with the OTM-R principles): if a candidate is selected without an open vacancy being advertised, an additional professorial staff member from the same department as the hiring professor should be involved in the selection process to provide a second opinion, thus adhering to the Four Eyes Principle.</p> <p>Additional rules regarding the recruitment of professorial staff funded by the Special Research Fund (BOF-ZAP) are stipulated in its staff regulations.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> Rules and regulations internally applied.</p>
17. Do we have clear rules concerning the composition of selection committees?		x	x	<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>See question 16</p> <p>Ghent University has stipulated that at most 2/3 of the members of any selection committee for professorial staff may be of the same gender. Faculties are encouraged (but this is not mandatory) to invite external experts to be a member of a selection committee for professorial staff.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Statistics on the composition of panels</li> <li>- Trend in the share of external members within selection committees</li> <li>- Publication of clear rules and written guidelines on the composition of selection committees on the website</li> </ul>
18. Are the committees sufficiently gender-balanced?		x	x	<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>See question 17</p> <p>Since 2012, Ghent University has stipulated that all official committees, including formal selection committees for the recruitment, appointment and promotion of professorial staff, are gender-balanced (i.e., at most 2/3 members of the same gender):</p> <p><a href="https://www.ugent.be/en/ghentuniv/principles/diversity-and-gender/recruitment-promotion-and-selection">https://www.ugent.be/en/ghentuniv/principles/diversity-and-gender/recruitment-promotion-and-selection</a></p> <p>For the recruitment of assistant academic and other research staff, ad hoc selection committees are set up, which are not necessarily gender-balanced (although, for assistant academic staff, the Faculty Board as the body making the final decision is gender-balanced).</p>

					<p><b>Indicator:</b> Monitoring the composition of selection committees with a specific focus on gender balance for both formal and informal selection procedures.</p>
19. Do we have clear guidelines for selection committees which help to judge 'merit' in a way that leads to the best candidate being selected?			x	<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>The general principles for the assessment of research, education, people management and leadership criteria are published on our website:  <a href="https://www.uqent.be/en/research/research-uqent/research-strategy/portfolio-research.htm">https://www.uqent.be/en/research/research-uqent/research-strategy/portfolio-research.htm</a>  <a href="https://www.uqent.be/en/qhentuniv/principles/educational-strategy/portfolioteachingdimensions.htm">https://www.uqent.be/en/qhentuniv/principles/educational-strategy/portfolioteachingdimensions.htm</a>  <a href="https://www.uqent.be/en/work/mobility-career/career-aspects/professorial-staff/portfolioteachingdimensions.htm">https://www.uqent.be/en/work/mobility-career/career-aspects/professorial-staff/portfolioteachingdimensions.htm</a>  <a href="#">Portfolio of institutional and societal engagement (see pdf under 'Templates and guidelines')</a></p> <p>These are specifically developed for the evaluation and promotion of professorial staff. In the near future, these criteria will be incorporated in the recruitment procedures as part of an OTM-R policy plan for all research staff.</p> <p>When certain research profiles are being hired (e.g., as part of a project call), specific guidelines are available for the members of the selection committee, such as those defined by the Special Research Fund. The application forms for professorial staff funded by the Special Research Fund (BOF-ZAP) are based on the ERC forms, in other words, with more focus on the qualitative information in the candidate's curriculum instead of on quantitative parameters.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Connecting merit-based criteria already being used and available for evaluation during the career with recruitment criteria</li> <li>- Training for selection committee members (see indicators question 3)</li> </ul>
<b>Appointment phase</b>					
20. Do we inform all applicants at the end of the selection process?		x		<i>++ Yes, completely</i>	<p>At the end of the selection process, all candidates are informed of the result. This is an automated process for vacancies that are included in the e-recruitment tool. Templates and guidelines for feedback to applicants are available from the HR Department.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> Templates and guidelines for feedback to applicants published on the website.</p>



21. Do we provide adequate feedback to interviewees?		x		<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>Templates for feedback after every step of the recruitment procedure are made available through the HR Department. Whether feedback is given after every step or at the end of the entire process depends on the culture of the faculty/hiring department. The ranking of the candidates is largely motivated by the faculty board in its report (but only accessible internally). Special Research Fund applicants receive intermediate feedback.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Templates and guidelines for feedback to applicants published on the website</li> <li>- Training for selection committee members (see indicators question 3)</li> </ul>
22. Do we have an appropriate complaints mechanism in place?		x		<i>+/- Yes, substantially</i>	<p>At Ghent University, an internal mechanism and procedure for complaints is in place (organised by the Department of Administrative Affairs). Externally, complaints can be addressed to the Council of State.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- Procedures are published on the website</li> <li>- Systematic monitoring (e.g., statistics) on complaints</li> </ul>
<b>Overall assessment</b>					
23. Do we have a system in place to assess whether OTM-R delivers on its objectives?				<i>-- No</i>	<p>Ghent University does not yet have an overarching and comprehensive monitoring system for OTM-R. Establishing the objectives of OTM-R and building a monitoring system will be part of the policy plan.</p> <p><b>Indicator:</b> System and mechanisms to monitor the effects of OTM-R.</p>